

## The Content Analysis of Students' ER Material Based on Course Learning Outcome

Niken Reti Indriastuti

Universitas Muhammadiyah Ponorogo; [nikenreti@gmail.com](mailto:nikenreti@gmail.com)

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32528/issn.v2i1.144>

\*Correspondence: Full Name

Email: Correspondence Email

Published: Agustus, 2022



**Copyright:** © 2023 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY NC) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

**Abstract:** One of Extensive Reading (ER) principles is learners are being free to choose their own reading material. Reading courses of English Education Program in Ponorogo Muhammadiyah University are delivered in four levels namely pre-intermediate, intermediate, pre-advanced, and advanced which have learning process using mixed approach of extensive and intensive. This study is aimed to investigate whether the material selected by the students in which extensive reading conducted have fulfilled course learning outcome (CLO) of each level. They were 187 students' reading material submitted as the final assignment and class discussion of all levels. Using content analysis approach to analyze them the result showed that most material had already fulfilled though there were still few material had not yet, however such condition is allowed in extensive reading.

**Key words:** course learning outcomes, ER, reading material

### INTRODUCTION

Extensive Reading or more popular as ER is an approach in reading learning that emphasizes on the independent reading quantity, as many as possible, and has main goals of pleasure and information as shown by Renandya et.al [1]. This approach is believed as an effective way to improve the learners's reading skill. Many studies to prove its effectiveness were conducted and they revealed that not only reading skill was improved moreover the other language aspects were improved too such as grammar, writing skill, and reading motivation. Dzulfikri and Ali Saukah[2] found that the use of ER coul improve their students' reading skill and linguistics competence as well and Arai's[3] study on the students of English teacher trainees in Japan showed that most of them agreed that ER was effective for their reading and writing skill. Ferdila[4]revealed from the research on teaching reading in public high school of Bandung that there are five benefits found, those are building students' perspective that reading is a fascinating activity, creating enjoyable learning atmosphere, helping students in developing a wide vocabulary, improving students' reading comprehension, and increasing students' motivation in reading. Kiyomi [5] has proven ER effectiveness in the development of reading and grammar knowledge of Japanese university students, the results of his study showed the grammar gain scores and reading rate gain scores were almost positive across all three participant classes.

There are ten principles of ER established by Day and Bamford which three of them indicate the learners' freedom to choose their own reading material as stated by Renandya et al. [1]. The freedom to choose the readers has given to learners' motivation in reading, they feel enthusiast because they could choose what they wanted to read as shown by Tanaka[6], Dzulfikri[2], and Groosman[7].

According to Yulia [8] it is a fact that the implementation of ER has positive effect for students' reading skill but it is criticized sometime due to the lack of suitable post reading activities. To assess their comprehension with a standard measure, as it is conducted in intensive reading with comprehension questions since the students are allowed to choose their own material is not an easy matter. Commonly the reading assessment is conducted to know whether the students' reading competence has fulfilled the learning outcome determined by the curriculum and to achieve it the learning material should be adjusted with course learning outcome (CLO). The problem could arise whenever the students are free to choose their own material if they could fulfill the learning outcome of reading course.

Such situation was faced by the researcher as a lecturer of reading course in English Education Program of Ponorogo Muhammadiyah University when ER was implemented in four different levels of reading course. ER is implemented partially during the course, half of the early semester they learned in IR way and second half they were purely in ER. The matter of reading material availability is not a problem anymore today since students can get it unlimitedly through the internet access. Indriastuti [9] revealed in the previous study that most students used internet to provide their reading material because it was considered easier than the other sources. Based on it, it is not doubtful that the principles of ER due to the easiness of that: (1) the reading material is easy.(2) a variety of reading material on a wide range of topics must be available; (3) learners choose what they want to read.; and (4) learners read as much as possible.

Course learning outcome (CLO) is an indicator of a course success in which the learners have a clear target of achieved competence at the end of the learning therefore it should have be stated before a course is implemented, its function is to check whether the designed course has been conducted perfectly. There are four levels of reading class in researcher's department: pre-intermediate, intermediate, pre-advanced, and advanced levels which are conducted in four semester continuously which have course learning outcome summarized in table 1 and 2:

Table 1 CLO of reading: pre-intermediate and intermediate levels

Number	Pre Intermediate	Reading Aspects Mastery	Intermediate
1	Contextual , idiomatic expressions including implicit and connotative	Vocabulary	Contextual , idiomatic expressions including implicit and connotative
2	All variety of texts	Text structures	All variety of texts
3	Simple	English structure	Simple to less complicated
4	Popular, scientific, literary	Topics	Popular, scientific, literary
5	Giving facts and opinions, reading aloud	Rhetoric aspect	Giving facts and opinions, reading aloud
6	perseverance and honesty, to skill of a note taking, summary making.	Skills related to intellectual work	perseverance and honesty to skill of a note taking, summary making
7	Scanning, skimming, previewing, predicting	Reading Strategies	Scanning, skimming, previewing, predicting

Table 2 CLO of reading: pre -advanced dan advanced levels

Number	Pre Advanced	Reading Aspects Mastery	Advanced
1	Contextual , idiomatic expressions including implicit and connotative	Vocabulary	Contextual , idiomatic expressions including implicit and connotative
2	All variety of texts	Text structures	All variety of texts
3	Medium complicated	English sturcture	More complicated
4	Popular, scientific, literary	Topics	Popular, scientific, literary
5	Giving facts and opinions, inferences	Rhetoric aspect	Giving facts and opinions, inferences, logic, synthesis (summary and précis )
6	perseverance and honesty, to skill of a note taking, summary making.	Skills related to intellectual work	perseverance and honesty, to create a mind mapping, to skill of a note taking, summary making, synthesizing, and presentation
7	All strategies possible to apply, especially graphic organizer	Reading Strategies	All strategies possible to apply, especially graphic organizer

As the fruitfulness of the material availability in the internet as the prime source for the students in reading, this investigation is to answer a question proposed: whether the reading material selected by the students could fulfill course learning outcome (CLO) of reading courses.

## METHOD

### Research Design

This study was designed as descriptive qualitative which described the suitability of the reading material selected by the students and the course learning outcome of four reading courses namely pre-intermediate reading, pre-advanced reading, intermediate reading and advanced reading in the academic year 2020/2021. The material intended is the material reported in reading journal submitted at the end of semester and the material presented in the class.

### Data and Data collection

Research data was reading material had been read and reported in journal of pre-intermediate and pre-advanced class, moreover for the class of intermediate and advance the data observed are material presented in the class discussion. The total number of reading material submitted in reading journal was 157 reading texts of pre-intermediate reading and pre-advanced reading students and 32 reading texts presented in class discussion of intermediate and advanced students.

The reading journals were submitted at the end of semester in the period of final exam that the students sent them via email meanwhile the discussion reading texts were collected during the period of class discussion.

### Data Analysis Technique

The data was analyzed by using content analysis method in which firstly they were classified into each course level, next they were being decoded based on the their course learning outcome as it is presented on the CLO table, then they were measured in their suitability scale of CLO, in the next step they were interpreted and the last they were presented.

Though the research was in the frame of qualitative, at the same time it used mix method to show quantitative data which presented the quantity of documents which were categorized into suitable or unsuitable with CLO.

### RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The following data presentation is showing the documents number classified based on the course.

Table 3 Number of reading material based on the courses

Number	Course	Amount
1.	Pre-intermediate Reading	91
2.	Intermediate Reading	20
3.	Pre-advanced reading	66
4.	Advanced Reading	12
	Total Amount	189

Then the next table is to illustrate the suitability of material chosen by the students of each level. “Lower” is a classification of reading material that could not fulfill the CLO meanwhile “suitable” and “higher” classification can be considered as material could fulfill. “Higher” is made to show CLO as minimum standard should be achieved that it can be higher than CLO.

Table 4 Number of reading material suitability with clo of each level

Level	lower		suitable		higher	
	amount	percentage	amount	percentage	amount	percentage
Pre-intermediate	30	33%	45	49%	16	18%
Intermediate	3	15%	13	65%	4	20%
Pre-advanced	5	7%	35	53%	26	40%
Advanced	0	0	12	100%	0	0
Total Amount	38	20%	105	56%	46	24%

The material considered lower than CLO or it could not fulfill CLO.

From table 4 in the level of pre intermediate there were many material which could not fulfill course learning outcome almost one third of the texts read or 33%. Such condition was indicated by many texts having simple denotative words and idioms and they were arranged with simple sentences structures in the type of simple descriptive, procedure, recount, and narrative. Let us read this following paragraph as the example of this category:

*My father, Lukman, is 5 years older than my mother. He is 52. In spite of his age he's still black-haired, with several grey hairs. He has bright blue eyes. He is quite tall, but a bit shorter than me. He's very hard-working. Besides that he is working in a travel company. He can even make a dinner when my mother is outside. His cooking and his meals are always very tasty as well as my mothers'.*

It is taken from a simple descriptive consisting three paragraphs which all have similar characteristics as the above paragraph has. It consists of simple sentences mostly, there are only one complex and one compound sentences. The use of connotative and implied meanings are almost none. When it is viewed from the topic the reader does not need special background knowledge since “father figure” is commonly very familiar to everyone. Then technically to comprehend such passages the use of high reading strategies is not necessary.

---

In table 4 it shows that the highest number of reading material could not fulfill CLO found in the level of Pre-intermediate reading where all the participants were new students in the first semester which was a transition learning period from high school into university. Most of the learners should adapt with a new learning culture which was different from the previous where the most material depended on the teacher's intervention and it is contrasted from ER which is an independent learning. This case indicates that they were not confident enough to expose their reading comprehension.

The next level is intermediate that the number of unsuitable texts were getting decreased it is only three from twenty texts or 15% since they had had an experience of independent reading in the previous semester. To show the example of this category it is one of them:

*Firstly, detoxifying Properties it helps detoxify the body from any potentially harmful substances. The best time to benefit from this process is to drink it first thing in the morning on an empty stomach. Start with one glass and gradually progress to two glasses.*

The above paragraph is a part of a text with a title "The Benefit of Drinking Mineral Water". It is an exposition text which consists of four paragraphs having similar sentence structures as the above one, the sentences used as they are used in the daily communication, therefore to comprehend the text does not need sophisticated reading strategies. Although there are some words having contextual meaning they can be understood easily because they are met in daily usage such as the meaning of "mineral water" and "detoxifying".

Pre-Advanced level as the next level had fewer number of material that could not meet CLO, there were only 7% of the whole or five texts from sixty six texts selected by the students. Here is a paragraph taken from one of those five texts:

*Human body is actually a living machine and is like all other machines. This living machine needs fuel to supply it with energy. The fuel is provided by the food which we eat. However do we know how much we need to stay healthy?  
The energy value of food is usually measured in calories. A calorie is the amount of heat the people are involved in. For example; people will need more calories for standing than for sitting, people need more for running than for walking, etc. which is required to raise the temperature of 1 kg of water by 1 degree C. The number of calories which people need per day varies. It depends on the activity which*

What a simple paragraph it is for the pre advanced level or upper intermediate class than they should choose. It contains simple sentences and it is a simple structured explanation text too meanwhile the words used having denotative meaning mostly. So as it has a common topic can be read in other compositions the readers were not required many strategies to understand.

Since in ER the learners are demanded to develop their own reading skill independently in the beginning phase or frustration level they usually face the challenging difficulty therefore the teacher's assistance is needed as shown by Jacobs [10]. According to Renandya et al. [1] that the students' reading material which is lower level than it should be is in accordance with ER principles since: (1) they are confident with their own ability; (2) their comprehension on easy language can

---

push their cognitive competence to relate their reading material with their real life; and (3) the easy language is able to be followed up by after reading activities related to other language skills.

### The Material Could Fulfill CLO

As the previous discussion this section is to reveal how far the selected reading material has met CLO, and the first example is taken from pre intermediate level:

*Critics have said that the game encourages violence, but the makers deny this and say that, while there is violence in the game, it is just an amusing look at school life, besides which, the violence in the game is directed against the bullies to protect pupils who are being bullied. The makers also say that players will learn to stand up to bullies.*

The above is the second paragraph taken from an exposition with the title “Bully For You”, the topic is very popular now among the students, that is way it is interesting to read although the structures are considered higher for its level. The text consists of three paragraphs but each has the similar structures as the second one. For all the readers should need varied strategies to comprehend.

Let us read the example of intermediate level, it is a paragraph of a passage with a title “Japan”:

*People here are friendly and hospitable. Even if they are a bit closed when it comes to new people, when they invite you for a dinner it means you are a good friend of them and you always can rely on them. I got to know so many interesting words like kawaii, sempai, arigato, ohayo etc. by lots of friends whom I met there and they all explained me the meanings of those words, so now I am even closer to this country and its philosophy of life.*

By using some Japanese words the readers should have a good enough background knowledge, by the name of interest this kind of readers has been ready to face such situation. The interest is one of principles proposed by ER. When it is measured from the complex sentence structures this description has already fulfilled CLO.

This following is an example of pre advanced level which is a paragraph of a mixed type of procedure and exposition article with a title “5 Ways To Persuade Yourself To Be More Productive”:

*If you've ever spent more time talking yourself into doing something than it actually took to complete the task, you know how hard self-motivation can be. Whether it's procrastination, distraction, or disinterest, the struggle can be real. Fortunately, there are some tricks that can help get you moving.*

Not only based on the length of the material is considered, the mixed type has added the complexity of the text and also its complex sentence structures.

The next sample is materials which has higher quality than CLO. It is very interesting found in pre intermediate level, based on the data that the number of lower qualified texts were many enough however we can see some texts with higher quality too although they were just few, for example:

---

*During the search, the National Transportation Safety Committee (NTSC) used the engines and available data from Flightradar24, and hypothesised that the plane had been still responsive upon impact, where it had ruptured. Investigators announced a focus on the aircraft's autothrottle due to its previous malfunctions.*

The above is a paragraph of a passage with a title “Sriwijaya Air Flight 182” which has many technical terms related to flight and also uses sentences with complex structures. It was assorted by the student when the plane getting a crash.

In level of intermediate there were around four percent of material that was higher than CLO, one of the example is the following:

*Although modern manga came to be amid an expansion of artistic creativity during **the US occupation of Japan between 1945 and 1952**, their origins can be traced centuries back. What many believed were the very first manga in Japan appeared in the 12th and 13th century, in a series of drawings like frogs and rabbits titled Choju-giga (Scrolls of Frolicking Animals) produced by several artists. In fact, their technique of drawing a characters' legs to simulate running was adopted by many **manga-ka** (manga makers and comic book artists) working today<sup>[1]</sup>. During **the Edo Period** (1603-1867), another book of drawings, Toba Ehon, embedded the concept of manga<sup>[2]</sup>, yet the term itself was first used in 1798, to describe the picture book Shiji no Yukikai (Four Seasons) by **SantōKyōden**. In 1814, it showed up again, as the title of Aikawa Mina's Manga hyakujo and the celebrated Hokusai Manga books of drawings by the famous ukiyo-e artist **Hokusai**.*

The topic of the text is manga, Japanese comic, which has been popular among the youngsters for several recent years. For people who are not interested with manga it is relatively hard to comprehend because of a lot of Japanese technical terms used besides there are many complex sentence structures found.

The higher the level the more confident were the learners to expose their reading competence and it was proven by pre advanced and advanced level. The material could fulfill CLO many more than the previous levels and even in advanced level all materials have met CLO. There were twenty six of sixty six texts that were higher than CLO in pre advanced level and here is the example:

*Researchers in a California biomechanics lab recently staged what should have been the most lopsided freshwater cage match of all time. In one corner was a red-bellied piranha, the razor-toothed terror of the Amazon. In the other was a three-striped cory, a faintly dopey-looking catfish about an inch long.*

The use of contextual words in the text is quite therefore the readers must have good background knowledge and sufficient reading strategy to understand this descriptive text: the complex sentence structures are dominant.

In ER readers can choose a higher level of reading material as well as the lower level. It is because the principle of interest on the topic lets the learners do it and such situation is normal as stated by Renandya and Jacobs [1]. For example when a reader took a topic about “Japan” there should be various levels of material that they could be higher or lower that the learners read. Ac-

---

ording to Jacobs [10] when a learner chooses the material higher than it should be, ER can develop the students' language competence involving vocabulary, grammar and spelling, reading skill, writing ability and their knowledge too.

### CONCLUSION

The implementation of extensive reading in reading courses at English education program of Ponorogo Muhammadiyah University is conducted to let the students be free choosing their own reading material. Based on the investigation result it showed that most selected reading material by the students had met course learning outcome of all levels with the following description: the materials had various kinds of topic, they had varied text structures and complexity level, they had varied sentence structures based on their level, the learners could use varied reading strategies well to present them. Regarding the students chose the lower or higher level than they should, it is because they would learn and meet their interest on certain topics. Such kinds of material could be found in each level consistently.

### REFERENCES

- [1] W. A. Renandya, G. M. Jacobs, and V. W. S. Yu, "Extensive reading in the second language classroom," *RELC Journal*, vol. 29, no. 2, pp. 187–191, 1998, doi: 10.1177/003368829802900211.
- [2] D. Dzulfikri and A. Saukah, "Extensive Reading in Action: Voices from the Grounds," *Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn)*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 111–119, 2017, doi: 10.11591/edulearn.v11i2.5971.
- [3] Y. Arai, "Extensive reading definitions, effectiveness, and issues concerning practice in the EFL classroom: Japanese teacher trainees' perceptions Yuya," *Journal of Extensive Reading*, vol. 7, 2019.
- [4] R. Ferdila, "the Use of Extensive Reading in Teaching Reading," *Journal of English and Education*, vol. 2014, no. 2, pp. 68–80, 2014.
- [5] Y. Kiyomi, T. Atsuko, and O. Kyoko, "How does extensive reading help Japanese EFL learners to develop grammatical knowledge and reading fluency," *Journal of Extensive Reading, Proceedings of the Fourth World Congress on Extensive Reading*, vol. 4, pp. 1–11, 2018.
- [6] M. Tanaka, "Exploring motivational changes for short in-class extensive reading," *Journal of Asia TEFL*, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 61–91, 2015, doi: 10.18823/asiatefl.2015.12.4.3.61.
- [7] B. H. Grossman, "Measuring Engagement in ER: Individual vs. Group Activities," 2018.
- [8] M. Frida Yulia, "Extensive Reading for Indonesian University Students: an Alternative Framework for Implementation," *Journal: A Journal on Language and Language Teaching*, vol. 21, no. 2, pp. 207–218, 2018, doi: 10.24071/llt.2018.210210.
- [9] N. R. Indriastuti, "Kesulitan Dan Strategi Mahasiswa Prodi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris Dalam Extensive Reading," *Jurnal Dimensi Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*. vol. 9, no. 2, 2021.
- [10] G. M. Jacobs, "Selecting Extensive Reading Materials," *Beyond Words*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 112–127, 2014.